

GREATER MANCHESTER COMBINED AUTHORITY

DATE: Friday, 27th September, 2019
TIME: 10.00 am
VENUE: Council Chamber, Bury Town Hall, Knowsley
Street, Bury, BL9 0SW

SUPPLEMENTARY AGENDA

- 9.b CORPORATE ISSUES & ENVIRONMENT - 17 SEPTEMBER 2019**
To note the minutes of the Greater Manchester Transport Committee held on 17 September 2019.
- 10. MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE HELD ON 13 SEPTEMBER 2019**
To note the minutes of the Greater Manchester Transport Committee held on 13 September 2019.

For copies of papers and further information on this meeting please refer to the website
www.greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk.

Alternatively, contact the following Governance & Scrutiny Officer:

✉ Sylvia.welsh@greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk
☎ 0161 778 7009

This agenda was issued 23 September 2019 on behalf of Julie Connor, Secretary to the Greater Manchester Combined Authority, Churchgate House, 56 Oxford Street, Manchester M1 6EU

This page is intentionally left blank

**GREATER MANCHESTER COMBINED AUTHORITY (GMCA)
CORPORATE ISSUES AND REFORM OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
17 SEPTEMBER 2019 AT 6.00PM AT GMCA OFFICES**

Present: Councillor Tim Pickstone (Bury) (in the Chair)
Bolton: Councillor Bob Allen
Bury: Councillor Stella Smith
Manchester: Councillor Ben Clay
Oldham: Councillor Colin McLaren
Rochdale: Councillor Kallum Nolan
Salford: Councillor David Jolley
Salford: Councillor Tanya Burch
Stockport: Councillor Dena Ryness
Tameside: Councillor Teresa Smith
Trafford: Councillor Anne Duffield
Trafford: Councillor Dave Morgan
Wigan: Councillor Joanne Marshall

In attendance

GMFRS Jim Wallace, Chief Fire Officer
Dawn Docx, Deputy Chief Fire Officer
Tony Hunter, Assistant Chief Fire Officer
Dawn Royle,

GMCA Kevin Lee, Director Mayor's Office
Andrew Lightfoot, Deputy Chief Executive
Jane Forrest, Assistant Director, Reform
Dave Kelly,
Smyth Harper, Head of News and Media
Joanne Heron, Statutory Scrutiny Officer
Jamie Fallon, Governance and Scrutiny Officer

Rochdale Council Mark Widdup, Executive Director

CI21/19 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Chris Goodwin (Oldham), John McGahan (Stockport), and Richard Paver (GMCA Treasurer).

Kallum Nolan left the meeting at 7.15pm.

CI22/19 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS

The Chair reminded Members that a number of their annual GMCA Register of Interest Form's were still outstanding.

Members were advised that moving forwards the GMCA would be publishing its meeting papers via Modern.gov, enabling a paperless and more modern approach. The Chair reminded Members to provide the device information requested as soon as possible so that they can be issued with a username and password.

It was noted that up to six Members of the Committee attended a budget training on 13 August 2019, which was hosted by Richard Paver, GMCA Treasurer. The session focussed on helping Members better scrutinise the budget setting process and was well received. The Committee considered whether they could benefit from a further training session in advance of the budget setting process, in particularly for those who were unable to attend. It was agreed that Officers would seek to identify a further date to be held prior to a future committee meeting (in October or November at 5-6pm)

The Chair informed the Committee that the Scrutiny Chairs had recently met with the Mayor to consider how the scrutiny committees could make a meaningful impact. As a result, it was recommended that the committees should, as appropriate, make recommendations formerly to the GMCA and request feedback. It was also agreed that the committees should consider developing a small number of focussed scrutiny working groups, to address cross cutting themes such as bus reform. It was noted that as the groups were developed, they would be communicated to Members.

RESOLVED:

1. That Members provide the device information requested to support the roll out of modern.gov.
2. That Officers consult with Members and officers on developing a further budget training session (in October or November, 5-6pm).

CI23/19 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest received.

CI24/19 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 16 JULY 2019

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 July 2019 were submitted for approval. A Member requested a correction to item CI/18/19 Programme for Change Outline Business Case, with reference to changing a 'two-pump incident' to state 'two-five-pump incident'.

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting held on 16 July 2019 be approved as a correct record subject to the correction to item CI/18/18 Programme for Change Outline Business Case.

CI25/19 UNIFIED PUBLIC SERVICES FOR THE PEOPLE OF GREATER MANCHESTER

Andrew Lightfoot, Deputy Chief Executive, GMCA introduced a report which provided an overview of the White Paper on Unified Public Services for the people of Greater Manchester which had been agreed by the GMCA in July 2019.

Jane Forrest, Assistant Director Reform, added that the White Paper sat alongside a number of key strategies for Greater Manchester including; the Local Industrial Strategy (LIS), the Health and Social Care (HSC) Prospectus, and the Standing Together Plan. It represents a significant step forward in our reform ambitions, setting out a 21st century vision for public services and putting forward Greater Manchester (GM) as an international leader in this field. Principally, it aimed to improve outcomes for people across Greater Manchester, but it also sought to provide a platform to influence the future direction of central government policy and spending.

It was acknowledged that the White Paper was not prescriptive in its nature, and did not define how services should be delivered, but asked that localities pay attention to delivering change inline with six key features, and did these things relentlessly to achieve greater change.

The detail of the GM Model was based on learning from work in neighbourhoods in each of the ten localities within GM, reform work in thematic areas (e.g. Troubled Families Programme, Working Well etc.) and a series of self-assessment processes conducted by the 10 localities of GM themselves.

Members received a presentation (at Appendix 1) from Mark Widdup, Executive Director, Rochdale Council, which provided an overview of the 'Reform and Transformation in the Rochdale Borough so far', outlining how Rochdale were implementing the principles, and what areas they were paying particular attention to.

The following key points were highlighted:

- The focus was not on policy but on citizens
- Rochdale have opted to split the borough into five townships (of 30,000-50,000) to enable connectivity to communities.
- Governance structures had been reviewed with the development of a Strategic Place Board (an amalgamation of PSR and the Health and Wellbeing Board).
- The focus was centred on the role of citizens.
- The workforce was being developed to ensure that leaders, and future leaders, can instill confidence in staff to work in the way outlined.

Members raised the following questions and comments:

- Members welcomed the proposal but highlighted that not all localities would be able to split their areas as suggested (into populations of 30,000-50,000 residents) due to urban areas. Would these areas be able to achieve the same outcomes? Jane Forest advised that the White Paper did not prescribe default population levels, but suggested that it made sense in terms of the administrative arrangements, to allow services to integrate, and provides the framework and opportunities to focus on smaller communities where there is need. This suggestion draws on the work which had taken place on the HSC integration agenda, which found that GP surgeries and schools were central to engaging with citizens.
- How will the GMCA encourage localities to review their governance arrangements, in particular, to strengthen their scrutiny arrangements? It was acknowledged that many

district scrutiny committees did not consider GMCA issues. It was advised that the White Paper recognised the need for strong scrutiny and oversight from localities, and set out what learning they might want to take forward together.

- Members expressed concern that the White Paper was ‘reinventing the wheel’, given localities had previously adopted a neighbourhood approach. It was felt that the challenge was persuading services to align along the same boundaries. Mark Widdup, acknowledged that localities had previously tried to adopt a similar approach. However, he felt a genuine willingness across localities to have a discussion with citizens, actively listen, and value their contribution, which had not been the case previously. Through implementing the approach Rochdale could now evidence its impact; which included a fiscal value of £4.05 for every £1 invested (Cost benefit analysis as validated by MHCLG 2019).
- Members welcomed the personable approach, which involved services ‘wrapping around a person in order to meet their needs’, but questioned whether this could affect the way budgets were allocated? It was reported that in Rochdale, the budget had been reviewed at a strategic level, to ensure that funding was allocated appropriately. Mark Widdup, added that citizens actively helping others (through volunteering) helped to make the budget go further.
- A Member referenced Lee’s story (case study on page 4), and the ‘sharing of Lee’s full situation with all partners’. Whilst this was encouraging, concerns were expressed over data protection challenges. Mark Widdup, reported that in Rochdale good relationships with colleagues had been developed, and data sharing agreements were in place across adult and children’s services, and GMP. It was acknowledged that data protection continued to be a challenge, which officers were actively trying to overcome.
- A Member reported issues when reporting anti-social behaviour (ASB) incidents with the Police and ASB team, with regards to where the responsibility lay. Members sought assurances that citizens would not be faced with similar issues when trying to access support. It was acknowledged that the White Paper recognised that all services played a joint role.
- Members sought clarification in relation to how social housing providers were being engaged in the process. It was confirmed that this was an iterative process, and the dialogue was ongoing between social housing partners. The aim was to identify how we can work collaboratively on this journey. From a citizens point of view, along with from an operational service delivery perspective it was imperative to incorporate all partners.
- A Member expressed the need for longer term commissioning arrangements to be developed, which were focussed on outcomes, as opposed to commissioning led. It was felt that services addressing complex needs such as the ‘Social Impact Bond’ required stability. It was confirmed that principally, the White Paper aimed to improve outcomes for people across GM, but also sought to provide a platform to influence the future direction of central government policy and spending. Members were informed that the GM Commissioning Hub, were exploring where the opportunities might be to commission for outcomes, rather than efficiency. Health was provided as an example of how through the partnership arrangements, the other determinants of health issues could be addressed differently.
- Members welcomed the reference to their ‘community leadership role’ but requested clarity as to how this role could be performed at neighbourhood level. It was confirmed that elected members played a key role in leading delivery in a place, and representing the voice of the community. Members can help ensure that services, resources and finances, were organised in the best interests of residents they represented.

RESOLVED:

1. That the content of the White Paper on Unified Public Services for the people of Greater Manchester, and its significance as part of our strategic ambition be noted.
2. That the points made by stakeholders and localities during the extended period of local engagement and consultation that ran from March 2019 to June 2019 be noted.
3. That it be noted that implementing the GM Model as described in the White Paper did not require, and was not intended for, any transfer of statutory responsibilities from public bodies up to the Greater Manchester Combined Authority.
4. That a further update be arranged in the next municipal year.

CI26/19

CONSULTATION REPORT FOR THE PROGRAMME FOR CHANGE BUSINESS CASE

Kevin Lee, Director of Mayor's Office, introduced the item, noting that following the close of the consultation and the continuing engagement with Trade Unions, Leaders had met that morning to consider the proposals, and had agreed the points below:

- a) Retaining current crewing levels and maintaining firefighter numbers at or above May 2017 levels for this financial year (and the Mayor is considering the options to extend this beyond April 2020);
- b) Retaining an additional 11 specialist prevention staff to support complex cases and address safeguarding concerns;
- c) Allowing more time for the transition of prevention activity to ensure firefighters are adequately trained and equipped;
- d) Developing alternative delivery models for volunteering and cadets;
- e) Retaining Princes Trust, reducing the number of teams from seven to five, whilst allowing more time to develop future options;
- f) Developing an improved delivery model for Protection including continued efforts on High Rise, Grenfell implications and improving fire safety within the Private Rented Sector;
- g) Undertaking a limited restructure of administration activity initially, allowing more time for the development of a centrally managed delivery model;
- h) Recommendation that the capital schemes as set out in the OBC are incorporated into the Service's Capital Programme;
- i) Ongoing investment in stations, including welfare facilities.

It was acknowledged that the revised proposals reflected previous concerns raised by the Committee, and Members were informed that the Mayor was keen to hear their views, before any final decisions were made.

Members were informed that with regards to the Government Spending Review, it was understood that the fire grant would be uplifted to be a flat grant, notwithstanding, confirmation had not yet been received in relation to addressing the pension's shortfall of £5.7 million. If the Government did not meet this shortfall, it would need to be addressed through the GMFRS budget. It was agreed that further updates would be circulated to the Committee as appropriate.

In relation proposal to reduce the number of non-uniformed staff, which initially would have affected 113 posts, it was highlighted that following consultation, this has reduced to 60 posts. It

was reiterated that, the Mayor and Deputy Mayor were still determined to avoid compulsory redundancies for support staff, and work was underway across the GMCA family, to identify alternative opportunities for those staff affected.

Members were informed that the Mayor was proposing to maintain the current crewing levels and firefighter numbers at or above May 2017 levels (1121 firefighters) for this financial year. This commitment, supported by overtime arrangements, and the continued use of reserves, has proposed to maintain current crewing arrangements of 5:4:4 and 50 fire engines in the short term, to allow more time for discussions with the Fire Brigades Union (FBU) about the number of fire engines available, and the crewing levels that could realistically be achieved. The long-term viability of this arrangement however, was dependent on future funding settlements from government, which at this stage was unclear.

Members raised the following questions and comments:

- Members from Manchester and Salford Labour groups queried whether their submissions had been considered as they were not represented within the report. It was agreed that this would be checked and Officers would ensure that these submissions were formerly represented within the consultation report.
- A Member sought clarity in relation to whether there had been any proposed changes to those set out for the Eccles Fire Station following the consultation. This station was important to Eccles as it was a specialist water and rescue station. It was agreed that clarification would be provided.
- Members requested further information regarding the financial impact of the proposed changes, and queried whether they were sustainable? It was acknowledged that the financial position was difficult, and it was difficult to know whether the proposals regarding firefighters were sustainable, until the outcome of the Spending Review was known, along with the outcome of the Mayor's budget discussions. It was noted that the reduction in the number of non-uniform staff at risk, had been largely achieved through effective vacancy management, along with voluntary severance and voluntary early retirements.
- How were the negotiations with trade unions (TU's) progressing? Kevin Lee confirmed that negotiations were ongoing, and the TU's were broadly supportive of the direction of travel.
- Members queried whether other Blue Light services were in support of the proposals. It was confirmed that Blue Light services were satisfied that the proposals met their requirements.
- A Member explored whether the Mayor would consider increasing the precept, so that the proposals could be delivered in a more sympathetic way. It was acknowledged that the raising of additional funds through an increase to the Fire and Rescue Service element of the Mayoral General Fund Precept would require further consideration as part of the budget consultation process.
- It was acknowledged that maintaining crewing levels of 5:4:4 without any additional funding, was not a viable option, as the required efficiencies would leave a crew of only 39 appliances. The sustainability of the proposals were reliant on government, as a flat rate grant would not allow us to continue at this rate, and an increase is needed if they are to make the service sustainable for the future. Members support was requested, to work with the GMCA to constructively make the case to government for an increase. Members welcomed the update and were in full support of the request.

Dawn Docx, Deputy Chief Fire Officer, GMFRS, advised that Members had been provided with the Consultation report, which provided some insight into the analysis process. Members

received a short presentation (Appendix 2) from Smyth Harper, Head of News and Media which provided an overview of the process, key findings and next steps.

Following the presentation Members raised the following questions and comments:

- A Member stated that previously Members had expressed that they did not feel they had been afforded sufficient time to comprehensively scrutinise the proposals.
- Members reiterated their concerns regarding the robustness of the plans, given the exponential rate of growth within the city region, in particularly inner city core, and the impact of congestion on response times.
- A Member raised concerns regarding the fact that many of the non-uniform staff at risk were likely to be predominantly female and whether this could be seen as discriminative.
- Further information was requested in relation to the stakeholder mapping, where posters and leaflets made available in key community hubs such as community centres, given that twitter had limited reach in many areas. Smyth Harper, advised that the focus of the campaign had been primarily on digital promotion, as this was considered the most effective way to reach most people. In addition there had been extensive engagement with key stakeholders (in the thousands), such as the community and voluntary sector groups across Greater Manchester, who were encouraged to share the information with their networks.
- The Committee considered how best to appropriately share their views with the Mayor, and following discussion, the following statement was proposed: 'Further to the consultation process, the Committee commends the development of the revised range of options set out in the OBC and acknowledges the progress made by the Mayor in his attempt to deliver transformational change within GMFRS. The Committee recognises the difficulties posed by the major uncertainties surrounding central government funding for fire and rescue services and reiterated that the various saving proposals around crewing levels and fire engine numbers remained wholly unacceptable.'
- The Chair brought the item to a close, noting that the Committee would need to consider the issues again as part of the budget setting process (Feb/March next year).

RESOLVED:

1. That the report be noted.
2. That the Committee be provided with further updates on addressing the pension's deficit as appropriate.
3. That Officers ensure that the consultation response submitted by Salford's Labour Group was formerly represented within the Consultation report.
4. That Officers ensure that the views of the Manchester Labour Group had been considered within the consultation and that these are formerly represented within the Consultation report.
5. That the Committee be provided with further information on whether any changes have been made to the proposals regarding Eccles Fire Station.

6. That Members agreed to support the GMCA in their lobbying to government, in relation to the GMFRS budget.
7. That the Mayor and Deputy Mayor are recommended to consider the Committee's views as follows; 'Further to the consultation process, the Committee commends the development of the revised range of options set out in the OBC and acknowledges the progress made by the Mayor in his attempt to deliver transformational change within GMFRS. The Committee recognises the difficulties posed by the major uncertainties surrounding central government funding for fire and rescue services and reiterated that the various saving proposals around crewing levels and fire engine numbers remained wholly unacceptable.'

CI27/19 **HER MAJESTY'S INSPECTORATE OF CONSTABULARY AND FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICES (HMICFRS) – FIRE INSPECTION REGIME UPDATE REPORT**

Tony Hunter, Director of Protection and SPPCI, GMFRS, provided an overview of the HMICFRS inspection regime, GMFRS inspection activities, and the response to the recommendations.

The following key points were highlighted:

- The HMICFRS published its report into GMFRS' 20th June 2019, on their website detailing how it had been graded. The Service was graded as 'Good' at:
 - Understanding the risk of fire and other emergencies and responding to fires and other emergencies.
 - Making the fire and rescue service affordable now and in the future.
- The report also highlighted several areas for improvement, with recommendations, where the Service should take actions to address. The report identified 19 'Areas for Improvement', 2 'Causes of Concern' and 4 'Recommendations'.
- Following the publication of the inspection report GMFRS had developed an action plan detailing the four recommendations and the planned actions to address these areas (Appendix A). The action plan had been aligned to the Programme for Change, so that areas of work could be progressed simultaneously. The action plan was progressing with vigour and would be updated regularly, with these published on the GMFRS website on the 'About Us' page.
- It was not yet clear when the next formal inspection of GMFRS would take place or whether the format would be a subsequent full inspection or themed against specific areas. An ongoing relationship would be maintained with the inspectorate through the HMICFRS SLO and sharing of progress updates against the action plan.

The Committee welcomed the update and requested that the next update be focussed upon how they were addressing the two areas which had been rated inadequate; equality and diversity, and culture.

RESOLVED:

1. That the report be noted.
2. That the recommendations for action from the HMICFRS report and GMFRS improvement plan to address these be noted.

3. That a progress report be provided in December 2019 focused on the areas which were rated 'inadequate' (equality and diversity, and culture).

CI28/19 WORK PROGRAMME

Joanne Heron, Statutory Scrutiny Officer, introduced the 2019/20 work programme for Members to review, develop and agree.

It was confirmed that the Mayor would be in attendance at the next meeting to present the Greater Manchester Strategy update. The Chair requested that the report outlines the challenging issues which the Mayor would like the Committee to consider. A Member suggested that the Committee may want to focus on homelessness.

The Committee were reminded that a further training sessions with Richard Paver, GMCA Treasurer would be arranged, to help Members better scrutinise the budget setting process. The training session would be scheduled prior to a Committee meeting at 5pm.

RESOLVED:

1. That the work programme be agreed.
2. That the Greater Manchester Strategy update report due to be considered by the Committee in October 2019 outline key areas for the Committee to consider.

CI29/19 GMCA REGISTER OF KEY DECISIONS

RESOLVED:

That the Register of Key Decisions be noted.

CI30/19 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Tuesday 15 October 2019 at 6pm, GMCA Offices

This page is intentionally left blank

MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY 13 SEPTEMBER 2019

PRESENT

Member

Councillor Derek Bullock
Councillor Roy Walker
Councillor Angeliki Stogia
Councillor Naeem Hassan
Councillor John Leech
Councillor Dzidra Noor
Councillor Ateeque Ur-Rehman
Councillor Howard Sykes
Councillor Sean Fielding
Councillor Phil Burke
Councillor Shah Wazir
Councillor Roger Jones
Councillor Barry Warner
Councillor Matt Wynne
Councillor Angela Clark
Councillor Warren Bray
Councillor Peter Robinson
Councillor Doreen Dickinson
Councillor Nathan Evans
Councillor Mark Aldred (Chair)
Councillor Joanne Marshall

Representing

Bolton
Bury
Manchester
Manchester
Manchester
Manchester
Oldham
Oldham
Oldham
Rochdale
Rochdale
Salford
Salford
Stockport
Stockport
Tameside
Tameside
Tameside
Trafford
Wigan
Wigan

Officers in attendance

Bob Morris	Chief Operating Officer
Kate Brown	Director of Corporate Affairs
Alison Chew	Interim Head of Bus Services
Alex Cropper	Head of Operations
Danny Vaughan	Head of Metrolink
Caroline Whittam	Head of Rail Franchising
Gwynne Williams	Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA
Sylvia Welsh	Governance and Scrutiny
Jamie Fallon	Governance and Scrutiny

Operators in attendance

David Golding	Network Rail
---------------	--------------

Christopher Jackson
Raj Chandarana
Kathryn O'Brien
Nigel Featham

Northern Railway
Northern Railway
First Group
Go Northwest

GMTC/29/19 APOLOGIES

RESOLVED /-

That apologies were received and noted from Councillors Beth Mortenson, David Meller, Liam O'Rourke, Steve Adshead, and Stuart Haslam.

GMTC/30/19 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS

RESOLVED /-

There were no chairs announcements or urgent business.

GMTC/31/19 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

RESOLVED /-

Councillor Phil Burke declared a personal interest in relation to Item 6 (Transport Network Performance), and Item 7 (Free Bus – Forthcoming Changes and Performance Update) as an employee of Metrolink.

GMTC/32/19 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD 9 AUGUST 2019

The minutes of the meeting held on the 9 August 2019 were submitted for consideration. Councillor Sykes confirmed that he was in attendance at this meeting, and requested that this be reflected within the minutes.

Councillor Evans confirmed that Officers had met with himself and Councillor Adshead to discuss the alternative options available to passengers who had previously used the 245 service. Following the meeting, a case study had been submitted for consideration, but no further feedback had been received.

Officers were informed that residents were compiling a petition regarding the withdrawal of the 389 service, which services Hyde and Duckinfield.

Members highlighted that they had not yet received the finalised Rail Prospectus, and a note detailing the transport support arrangements for Party Conferences, including plans for fringe receptions. Members requested that this information be circulated as soon as possible.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the minutes of the GM Transport Committee held on 9 August be approved as a correct record, subject to the addition of Councillor Sykes to the attendance.
2. That it be noted that Officers had met with Councillor Evans and Adshead to discuss the alternative options available to passengers who had previously used the 245 service and were awaiting a final response regarding the case study submitted.
3. That it be noted that TfGM would be in receipt of a petition regarding the withdrawal of the 389 service servicing Hyde and Duckinfield.
4. That it be noted that Officers would circulate the Rail Prospectus, and a note detailing the transport support arrangements for Party Conferences including plans for fringe receptions as soon as possible.

GMTC/33/19 GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME

Gwynne Williams, Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA, took members through the work programme for the GM Transport Committee, confirming that it reflected the reports previously requested by the Committee.

Members felt that there was a need to focus more on policy development opportunities, and requested the following items be included within the work programme:

October 2019

- High Speed 2 and 3
- Tram/Train Development
- Tram Technology Update (electric and hydrogen)

November / December 2019

- Rail Investment Bids – Pipeline Overview
- Update on the future of Piccadilly Platforms 15 and 16
- Brexit (the predicted impacts on Transport and Investment)
- Climate Emergency (how can emission reduction be accelerated in transport)
- GM Clean Air Update (electric vehicles, charging points, taxi's, small businesses)
- GM Minimum Standards for Taxi and Private Hire Update
- Made to Move Update

Concerns were raised, regarding the number of items contained within the work programme, which had not yet been assigned a meeting date, contact officer, or key function, given that there were only six meetings remaining within this municipal year.

Members considered the implications of the climate emergency, which the GMCA had declared at its July 2019 meeting, and explored how the Committee could support the acceleration of the reduction of emissions in transport. Members were reminded that the 10 local authorities of GM were working collaboratively to develop a GM Clean Air Plan, notwithstanding that, the Committee could formerly submit their views to the GMCA for consideration.

Councillor Jones expressed his thanks to TfGM and the GM Chamber of Commerce for hosting the Clean Air Roadshow, at AJ Bell Stadium, on 10 September 2019, which was well received by businesses. It was suggested that Officers explore further opportunities to host events across GM to encourage businesses to participate across GM.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the draft work Programme from September 2019 to January 2020 be noted, with the addition of the following items:

October 2019

- High Speed 2 and 3
- Tram/Train Development
- Tram Technology Update (electric and hydrogen)

November / December 2019

- Rail Investment Bids – Pipeline Overview
 - Update on the future of Piccadilly Platforms 15 and 16
 - Brexit (the predicted impacts on Transport and Investment)
 - Climate Emergency (how can emission reduction be accelerated in transport)
 - GM Clean Air Update (electric vehicles, charging points, taxi's, small businesses)
 - GM Minimum Standards for Taxi and Private Hire Update
 - Made to Move Update
2. That Officers be requested to include specific details relating to the reports to be scheduled (Meeting date, contact officer, alignment to which key function of the Committee)
 3. That it be noted that the 10 local authorities of GM were working collaboratively with the GMCA on the GM Clean Air Plan.
 4. That the Committee record its thanks to Officers for hosting the Clean Air Roadshow, at AJ Bell Stadium, on 10 September 2019, and that Officers be requested to explore opportunities to host further events across Greater Manchester.

GMTC/34/19 TRANSPORT NETWORK PERFORMANCE – JULY 2019

Alex Cropper, Head of Operations, TfGM, provided an overview of Transport Network Performance in Greater Manchester for July 2019.

The following key points were raised:

- Metrolink performance was not as strong in July 2019, with performance improved during early August 2019, noting that this would be reflected in next month's report.
- Metrolink services had recently been disrupted as a consequence of a fatality on the network, at the Burton Road stop, impacting on reliability. Members were reminded of the impact of such instances on staff, with many receiving counselling. In order to address this growing trend, Officers were exploring opportunities to raise awareness of the issue.
- Contactless payments had now been launched on Metrolink services (on 15th July 2019). Since its launch, approximately 100,000 users had taken journeys using contactless.
- Rail performance continued to be of concern with continued dialogue with train operators regarding the roll out of new rolling stock.
- Bus performance had maintained a good level of performance, with performance above the targets for scheduled service reliability and overall punctuality. It was noted that Go-Ahead were continuing to add value to the bus network in Greater Manchester.
- Members were informed that TfGM had been independently nominated for a National Transport Award.

Members raised concerns regarding the performance of a number of bus services, (including the 471, 163, 98) which were now being operated by Diamond North West. Officers confirmed that they were monitoring the situation, adding that the operator was actively recruiting bus drivers. Officers offered to meet with those Members who wished to raise specific operational issues.

Councillor Fielding reported that a number of his constituents had been incorrectly charged for their Metrolink journeys, following the introduction of contactless payments. It was confirmed that the launch of contactless payments had been an extraordinary success. There were still some teething issues to be addressed, with enhanced communication messages had been implemented, including on stop support and driver announcements to remind passengers. The Committee were informed that Metrolink Passengers who had been incorrectly charged using contactless payments, could request a refund via TfGM.

Further information was requested in relation the breakdown of reliability issues by Metrolink line, so that Members could seek to address these locally. It was agreed that this analysis would be incorporated in to future Metrolink Performance reports (next update in October).

RESOLVED /-

1. That the report be noted.
2. That it be noted that dialogue with train operators regarding performance and the roll out of new rolling stock continued.
3. That it be noted that Metrolink services had recently been disrupted as a consequence of a fatality on the network, at the Burton Road stop, resulting in an impact on reliability. This incident has had a severe impact on staff and Officers were exploring opportunities to raise awareness of the growing issue.
4. That it be noted that TfGM were monitoring the issues affecting contactless payments on Metrolink (double tapping and incomplete journeys), and enhanced communication messages (including on stop support and driver announcements) have been implemented to remind passengers.
5. That it be noted that Metrolink Passengers who have been incorrectly charged using contactless payments can request a refund via TfGM.
6. That it be noted that a breakdown of reliability issues by Metrolink line be incorporated in to future Metrolink Performance reports (next update in October).
7. That it be noted that there had been a number of issues relating to performance, following the operation of a number of bus services by Diamond North West, including capacity, with officers offering to meet with those Members who wished to raise specific operational issues.
8. That it be noted that Diamond North West are actively recruiting drivers to address capacity issues.
9. That it be noted that TfGM had been independently nominated for a National Transport Award.

GMTC/35/19 FREE BUS – FORTHCOMING CHANGES AND PERFORMANCE REPORT – KEY DECISION

Alison Chew, Interim Head of Bus Services, TfGM, introduced a report which informed Members of the proposed changes to the Manchester Free Bus service and also provided an update on performance.

The following key points were highlighted:

- Following a retendering exercise last October, First had been awarded the contract to operate the free bus service, which replaced the previous Manchester Metroshuttle service.
- Free Bus has been operated by Go North West since June 2019, following the sale of the Queens Road bus depot and operations from First to the Go Ahead Group.
- The proposed changes to the Free Bus service have been derived following a review of performance during its first year of operation, including ongoing operational issues and recurring themes in customer and operator feedback. TfGM officers have worked with the operator to find a cost-neutral but effective way of improving the service for customers.

Councillor Leach requested further information regarding the rationale for the removal of daytime free bus services servicing Deansgate and Oxford Road. It was confirmed that the proposals had been developed following a review of patronage and alternative transport links, and customer feedback. Feedback from users indicated that the night-time economy (services which run between 7pm and 12pm) were more likely to use these stations. It was agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Leach to discuss the rationale for the removal of daytime Deansgate and Oxford Road stations free bus services.

Councillor Wynne highlighted that he had not received an update from Officers regarding the Stagecoach proposal, which was developed following the withdrawal of the Stockport Metro in April 19. It was agreed that Officers would provide an update to Councillor Wynne.

Councillor Burke raised concerns regarding the substantial increase in the prices of children's tickets implemented by Rosso. It was agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Burke to these concerns.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the performance of the service noted.
2. That the proposed changes to the Manchester Free Bus Service be approved.

3. That it be agreed that Officers would provide an update to Councillor Wynne regarding the Stagecoach proposal, which was developed following the withdrawal of the Stockport Metro in April 19.
4. That it be agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Leach to discuss the rationale for the removal of daytime Deansgate and Oxford Road stations free bus services.
5. That it be noted that evening services run between 7pm and 12pm.
6. That it be agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Burke to discuss the increase in the price of children's tickets implemented by Rosso.

GMTC/36/19 RAIL ANNUAL PERFORMANCE

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer, TfGM, introduced a report which provided Members with an annual overview of rail performance in Greater Manchester from Rail Period 5, 2018/19 to Period 4 2019/20 (22 July 2018 – 20 July 2019).

A Member referred to the Transport for the North rail survey results, which indicated that when compared to last year, users felt that rail service performance had continued to decline. Northern confirmed that they judge their performance against the results of the National Rail Passenger Survey (NRPS), which had demonstrated a 17% increase in customer satisfaction since May 2018. The results indicated that punctuality was the biggest driver of satisfaction, followed by how delays are handled, and cleanliness.

It was felt that this level of increase was minimal when compared to the performance levels, following the introduction of the May 2018 timetable. Northern recognised that there was more to do, and confirmed that they were working extremely hard to rebuild trust and increase patronage, with the launch of campaigns such as the '£1m giveaway', and the 'flash sale.' Transpennine Express reported that in order to address many of the issues such as overcrowding, investment in the North was required.

Councillor Burke raised concerns regarding the short notice cancellations, and non stopping trains, with no advance notice, which was affecting Rochdale stations (Smithy Hill, Castleton and Mills Hill). Northern confirmed that this was primarily due to driver shortages and the priority given to London train services. Members assured that work continued to develop proposals for one set of terms and conditions train drivers which would replace the current three different sets terms and conditions. Sunday working for high number of train drivers was voluntary, and often led to a shortage and consequently the need for short notice cancellations of many services, particularly in the North West. It was noted that Northern were continuing their dialogue with Storm and Aslef, with a view to retabling the proposals later in the year. Northern agreed to meet with Councillor Burke to discuss how the issues can be handled more appropriately.

Councillor Clark welcomed the platform extension at Brinnington Station, and requested further information regarding the Hathersage and Hope platform extensions, which would be able to accommodate longer trains with more seats. Northern agreed to provide further information on the progress of developments.

Councillor Noor raised concerns regarding the appearance of Levenshulme Station, and queried whether any improvements were planned. Northern advised that they had invested approximately £50million into improving the customers experience at stations, noting that Levenshulme, was included in a future work programme. Further work would be undertaken to look at improvements in the short term.

It was noted that Northern had also allocated £250,000 in funding to Community Groups who had helped to improve the aesthetics of stations such as Hope Valley and Heaton Chapel.

Members sought clarification on the timetable for the removal of Pacers Units from operation in GM. Northern confirmed that all Pacers Units would be removed in Greater Manchester by the end of the year. Currently 19 new trains were in operation on routes across the North West, with a view to widening across the network throughout the remainder of the year.

It was agreed that Northern would invite Members to the new train launch events, which would be announced over the next few months.

It was felt that although the report indicated that there had been improvements in the number of short formed trains, this paired with overcrowding on trains, continued to be a significant issue. Members requested that an analysis be incorporated into future rail performance reports. Officers confirmed that dialogue with train operators was continuing in order to address the issues affecting performance.

Councillor Wynne raised concerns regarding the number of penalty fares issued by Northern since 2017, and requested that future performance reports include this analysis. Following discussion, it was agreed that Northern would meet with Councillor Wynne to discuss the number of penalty fares issued since 2017.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the report be noted.
2. That the Committee's concerns regarding ongoing rail performance issues be noted.
3. That it be noted that Northern were continuing their dialogue with Storm and Aslef regarding a new terms and conditions for drivers, with a view to retabling the proposals later in the year.

4. That it be noted that Northern would meet with Councillor Burke regarding the short notice cancellations affecting Rochdale stations (Smithy Hill, Castleton and Mills Hill).
5. That it be noted that dialogue with train operators regarding overcrowding, and in particular around 'stop skipping' and 'short forming' continues.
6. That an analysis of 'short forming' be incorporated in to future Rail Performance reports.
7. That an analysis of 'penalty fares' issued since 2017 be incorporated into the next Rail Performance report.
8. That it be agreed that Northern would meet with Councillor Wynne to discuss the number of penalty fares issued since 2017, given the ongoing performance issues to be addressed.
9. That it be agreed that Northern would provide further information to Members regarding the Hathersage and Hope platform extensions.
10. That it be noted that improvements to the appearance of Levenshulme Station were including in a future programme of work, with a view to exploring improvement options.
11. That it be noted that Northern would invite Members to the new train launch events.

GMTC/37/19 CENTRE FOR LOCAL ECONOMIC STRATEGY

Kate Brown, Director of Corporate Affairs, TfGM, presented a report which provided an overview of the Centre for Local Economic Strategies (CLES).

Councillor Jones commended the excellent work conducted by CLES for GM local authorities, and explored whether Members could be provided with an overview of the transport related work they had conducted for GM, in order to raise awareness of the wealth of support they provide. Officers confirmed that they would contact CLES to explore whether this request could be met.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the key policy areas and previous commission for TfGM be noted.
2. That the Committee record its thanks to CLES for the support it has provided to Greater Manchester regarding the development of economic and social research and policy with a focus on people and place.

3. That it be agreed that Officers would contact CLES to request that they provide an overview of the transport related work they have conducted for GM local authorities which can be shared for Members to raise awareness.

GMTC/38/19 RAIL STATIONS ACCESS FOR ALL MID TIER PROGRAMME

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer, TfGM, introduced a report, which provided an update on the proposed Greater Manchester submission to the Access for All Mid-Tier Programme in October 2019.

The following key points were highlighted:

- In July 2019, DfT announced the Access for All Mid-Tier programme. The fund would provide £20 million nationally, focused on stations where accessibility improvements could be delivered, with a fixed contribution per nomination of up to £1 million of government support.
- The fund was targeted at smaller scale access improvements.
- It is proposed that a single nomination covering a number of smaller improvements at 22 stations would be submitted.
- An update report would be presented at the meeting on the 11th October 2019 prior to the submission of the Access for All mid-tier submission on the 18th October 2019.

Councillor Leach enquired whether the 22 stations were listed in priority order, and explored what action would be taken, should the bid only be partially successful. It was confirmed that the list was in geographical order, noting that should the bid only be partially successful, the process of prioritising projects would be unique, based upon deliverability and value for money. It was acknowledged that previous bid submissions which had been listed in priority order, had not been awarded in this way.

Councillor Fielding raised concerns regarding the accessibility issues at Greenfield Station, noting that the interim solution, paying for taxis to Stalybridge was not sustainable. It was confirmed that Officers had raised the issue at the Transport for North Board, and were continuing to explore the potential funding options.

RESOLVED /-

1. That the report be noted.
2. That it be noted that an update report will be presented to the GMTC on the 11 October 2019, prior to submission of the Access for All mid-tier submission on the 18 October 2019.

3. That it be noted that Officers were continuing to explore the potential funding options, in order to address the accessibility issues at Greenfield Station, including raising the issue at the Transport for North Board.